

ITEM NO.501(PH)

COURT NO.2

SECTIONS PIL-W/X/XIV

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Writ Petition(Civil) No.1099/2019

SHAH FAESAL AND ORS.

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ANR.

Respondent(s)

(FOR ADMISSION AND IA No. 129177/2019 - EX-PARTE STAY, IA No. 164438/2019 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION, IA NO.136349/2019 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT, IA No. 129178/2019 - PERMISSION TO FILE LENGTHY LIST OF DATES AND IA No. 166037/2019 - STAY APPLICATION)

WITH

W.P.(C) No.1013/2019 (PIL-W)

FOR ADMISSION and IA No.118588/2019-EX-PARTE STAY, IA No.118589/2019-PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON, IA No.145853/2019-CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION, IA No. 143833/2019-INTERVENTION APPLICATION, IA No. 136293/2019 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT AND IA No. 145852/2019 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT)

W.P.(C) No. 722/2014 (PIL-W)

(FINAL DISPOSAL and IA No.79570/2017-INTERVENTION APPLICATION, IA No.79897/2017-INTERVENTION APPLICATION, IA No.81485/2017-Impleading Party, IA No.95744/2017-INTERVENTION APPLICATION, IA No.96065/2017-Impleading Party, IA No.110779/2017-VAKALATNAMA AND MEMO OF APPEARANCE and IA No.110782/2017-Impleading Party[FOR CONSIDERATION OF THE PRAYER FOR INTERIM RELIEF])

W.P.(C) No. 871/2015 (PIL-W)

(IA No. 38200/2019 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT, IA No. 34489/2019 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT AND IA No. 1/2015 - PERMISSION TO FILE SYNOPSIS AND LIST OF DATES)

W.P.(C) No. 396/2017 (X)

(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.43725/2017-PERMISSION TO FILE LENGTHY LIST OF DATES, IA No. 118468/2018 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION AND IA No. 43725/2017 - PERMISSION TO FILE LENGTHY LIST OF DATES)

SLP(C) No. 19618/2017 (XIV)

(IA No. 182696/2018 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION)

W.P.(C) No. 756/2017 (PIL-W)

(FOR ADMISSION)

W.P.(C) No. 398/2018 (X)

(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.49478/2018-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN REFILEING WRIT PETITION and IA No.49481/2018-PERMISSION TO FILE SYNOPSIS AND LIST OF DATES)

W.P.(C) No. 924/2018 (PIL-W)

(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.109719/2018-PERMISSION TO FILE LENGTHY LIST OF DATES)

W.P.(C) No. 1092/2018 (X)W.P.(C) No. 1162/2018 (PIL-W)

(FOR ADMISSION)

W.P.(C) No. 1082/2019 (X)

(FOR ADMISSION)

W.P.(C) No. 1048/2019 (PIL-W)

(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.122866/2019-PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON AND IA No. 136357/2019 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT)

W.P.(C) No. 1068/2019 (PIL-W)

(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.125260/2019-STAY APPLICATION AND IA No. 136304/2019 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT)

W.P.(C) No. 1037/2019 (X)

(FOR ADMISSION)

W.P.(C) No. 1062/2019 (PIL-W)

(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.124539/2019-EX-PARTE STAY, IA No.124540/2019-PERMISSION TO FILE LENGTHY LIST OF DATES, IA No. 136347/2019 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT AND IA No. 124540/2019 - PERMISSION TO FILE LENGTHY LIST OF DATES)

W.P.(C) No. 1070/2019 (PIL-W)

(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.125529/2019-GRANT OF INTERIM RELIEF AND IA No. 136314/2019 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT)

W.P.(C) No. 1104/2019 (X)

(FOR ADMISSION)

W.P.(C) No. 1165/2019 (PIL-W)

(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.140590/2019-EX-PARTE STAY and IA No.140592/2019-PERMISSION TO FILE LENGTHY LIST OF DATES)

W.P.(C) No. 1210/2019 (PIL-W)

W.P.(C) No. 1222/2019 (X)

(FOR ADMISSION)

W.P.(C) No. 1268/2019 (PIL-W)

W.P.(C) No. 1368/2019 (PIL-W)

(FOR ADMISSION)

Date : 23-1-2020 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE N.V. RAMANA
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SANJAY KISHAN KAUL
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE R. SUBHASH REDDY
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE B.R. GAVAI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SURYA KANT

For Petitioner(s)

In WP(C)No.1013/19 Mr.Manohar Lal Sharma,Petitioner-in-person

In WP No.1165/19 Dr. Rajeev Dhavan, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Pritha Srikumar, AOR
Mr. Sulabh Rewari, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Chatterjee, Adv.
Ms. Arunima Kedia, Adv.
Mr. Amrutanshu Dash, Adv.

- In WP(C)No.1013/19 For Impleader Mr. Dinesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. K. K. Mohan, AOR
Mr. Prateek Dwivedi, Adv.
Mr. Krishnam Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Yasharth Kant, Adv.
Mr. Nishant Singh, Adv.
- In WP(C)No.722/14 Mr. Barun Kumar Sinha, Adv.
Mrs. Pratibha Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Anil Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Rakesh Muddgal, Adv.
Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR
- In WP(C)No.1092/18 Mr. Vishnu Shankar Jain, AOR
- In SLP(C)No.19618/2017 Mr. Anil Kumar Jha, AOR
Ms. Vijaya Lakshmi Jha, Adv.
Ms. Jyoti Kumari, Adv.
- In WP(C)No.1099/19 Ms. Nitya Ramakrishnan, Adv.
Mr. Shankar Narayan, Adv.
Mr. Prasanna S., Adv.
Mr. Shadan Farasat, Adv.
Ms. Malavika Prasad, Adv.
Mr. Jaya Vardhan Singh, Adv.
Ms. Jahanvi Sindhu, Adv.
Ms. Shruti Narayan, Adv.
Mr. Gautam Bhatia, Adv.
Mr. Aakarsh Kamra, AOR
- In WP(C)Nos.1013/19 in caveat & 396/17 Mr. Bimal Roy Jad, AOR
Mr. N.G. Dev, Adv.
Ms. Shikha Dixit, Adv.
Mr. Sumit Moza, Adv.
- In WP(C)No.1070/19 Mr. Shekhar Naphade, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Prashanto Sen, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ranvir Singh, Adv.
Mr. Kaustav Som, Adv.
Mr. Ankur Singh, Adv.
Ms. S. Lakshmi Iyer, Adv.
Ms. Aishwarya Dash, Adv.
Mr. Kaustubh Singh, Adv.
Mr. Arjun Krishnan, AOR
- In WP(C)No.398/18 & IA 9573/20 IN WP No.1099/19 Mr. Ranjit Kumar, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ravindra Raizada, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Divya Roy, AOR
Mr. Yashraj Singh Bundela, Adv.
Mr. Surjeet Nehra, Adv.
Mr. Sarthak Raizada, Adv.
Mr. Apoorv Shukla, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Gaggar, Adv.

Mr. Vishal Arun, Adv.
Mr. Santosh, Adv.

In WP(C)No.1062/19 Mr. C.U. Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Saif Mahmood, Adv.
Mr. Vivek Agarwal, Adv.
Ms. Lavanya Bisht, Adv.
Mr. D. Abhinav Rao, AOR

In WP(C)No.1368/19 Mr. Sanjay Parikh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Abhimanue Shrestha, AOR

For WP(C)No.1104/19 Mr. P. Chidambaram, Sr. Adv.
& 1037/19 Mr. Jaideep Gupta, Sr. Adv.
Mr. D. Mahesh Babu, AOR
Mr. Shishir Pinaki, Adv.
Mr. Rajiv Kumar Sinha, Adv.
Mr. P. Nirup, Adv.
Mr. Ganesan Subbian, Adv.
Mr. Gautam Bhatia, Adv.
Ms. Malvika Prasad, Adv.
Mr. Sourav Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Anandita Mitra, Adv.
Ms. Suchitra Hrangkhawl, Adv.
Mr. Katubadi Ismail, Adv.
Wani Yasmeen, Adv.

For WP(C)No.871/15 Mr. Purushaindra Kaurav, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Anirudh Sharma, AOR
Mr. Yashraj Singh Bundela, Adv.
Mr. Apoorv Shukla, Adv.
Mr. Sarthak Raizada, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Gaggar, Adv.
Mr. Surjeet Singh, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Tanwani, Adv.
Ms. Anuradha Mishra, Adv.
Ms. Kanti, Adv.

In WP(C)No.1068/19 Mr. Gopal Sankaranarayanan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Soayib Qureshi, Adv.
Mr. Dhananjaya Sud, Adv.
Mr. Shrutanjaya Bhardwaj, Adv.
Mr. Vishal Sinha, Adv.
Ms. Charu Ambwani, AOR
Ms. Gayatri Verma, Adv.
Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR

In WP(C)No.1082/19 Mr. Vikrant Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Puneet Chugh, Adv.
Mr. Ashok Kumar Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Gaurav Dhingra, Adv.
Ms. Indira, Adv.
Mr. Syed Imtiaz Ali, Adv.

Mr. M. C. Dhingra, AOR

In WP(C)No.1162/18 Mr. Ashwani Kumar Dubey, AOR

Mr. Pallav Mongia, AOR

For WP(C)No.1222/19

Mr. Mohd. Irshad Hanif, AOR

In WP(C)No.1048/19 Mr. Shakir Shabir, Petitioner-in-person
Mr. Tushar Gupta, Adv.

In WP(C)No.1210/19 Mr. C.U. Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. P. V. Dinesh, AOR
Ms. Sindhu T.P., Adv.
Mr. Mukund P. Unny, Adv.
Mr. Bineesh K., Adv.
Mr. Ashwini Kumar Singh, Adv.

In WP(C)No.756/17 Ms. Shilpa Singh, AOR
Mr. Tripurari Ray, Adv.
Mr. Balwant Singh Billowria, Adv.
Mr. Atul Wadera, Adv.
Mr. Parveen Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Vijay Pratap Singh, Adv.
Mr. Vivekanand Singh, Adv.
Mr. Nitish Shekhar, Adv.

For Respondent(s)

In WP(C)Nos.1013/19 Mr. K.K. Venugupal, AG
Mr. Tushar Mehta, SG
Mr. Vikramjit Banerjee, ASG
Mr. K.M. Nataraj, ASG
Mr. Kanu Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. Ankur Talwar, Adv.
Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.
Mr. Siddhartha Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Prashant Rawat, Adv.
Mr. Ayush, Adv.
Ms. Shruti Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. A.K. Sharma, AOR

In WP(C)No.1070/19
& WP(C)No.1099/19 Mr. Bimal Roy Jad, AOR

Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, AOR

For Inter-continental Association of Lawyers Mr. Debasis Misra, AOR (Not present)

In WP(C)No.722/14 Mr. Mohit Chaudhary, AOR
For Intervenor Mr. Chaudhary Zulfikar Ali, Adv.
Ms. Puja Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Kunal Sachdeva, Adv.
 Mr. Imran Ali, Adv.
 Mr. Parveen Kumar, Adv.
 Ms. Garima Sharma, Adv.
 Ms. Sristi Gupta, Adv.

In WP(C)No.722/14 For Impleader Mr. Talha Abdul Rahman, AOR
 Mr. Mohd. Shaz Khan, Adv.

In WP(C)No.722/14 For Impleader Mr. Suhail Malik, Adv.
 Mr. Neeraj Srivastava, Adv.
 Mr. Asutosh Sharma, Adv.
 Mr. Manju Jaitley, AOR

Mr. M. J. Paul, AOR

Mr. Ashok Mathur, AOR

Mr. B. V. Balaram Das, AOR

Mr. B. Krishna Prasad, AOR

In WP(C)Nos.1013/19 & 1368/19 Mr. Tushar Mehta, SG
 Mr. D.C. Raina, AG for UT OF J&K
 Ms. Shashi Juneja, Adv.
 Mr.Satyajeet Kumar, AOR

In WP(C)no.722/14 For Impleader Mr. Anupam Raina, AOR
 Mr. Sunando Raha, Adv.

IA 106447/18 in WP No.722/14 Mr. P.V. Surendranath, Sr. Adv.
 Ms. Resmitha R. Chandran, AOR
 IA No.182696/18 in SLP(C) No.19618/17 Mr. Sawan Kumar Shukla, Adv.
 Mr. subhash K.R. Chandran, Adv.

IA 174521/19 Mr. Ummar Farooq, Adv.
 Mr. Adil Muneer Andrabi, AOR

In WP(C)Nos.1013/19, 1082/19,1048/19, 1068/19,1037/19, 1062/19,1070/19, 1099/19 &1104/19 For Impleader Mr. Charanjeet Chanderpal, Adv.
 Mr. Anil Kumar, AOR

In WP(C)No.1013/19 Mr. Barun Kumar Sinha, Adv.
 Mrs. Pratibha Sinha, Adv.
 Mr. Anil Kumar, Adv.
 Mr. Rakesh Muddgal, Adv.
 Mr. B. K. Satija, AOR

In WP(C)No.1099/19 for Intervenor Mr. Abhijeet Shah, Adv.
 Mr. Omprakash Ajitsingh Parihar, AOR

- In WP(C)No.1013/19 Dr. Nishesh Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Harvinder Chowdhury, AOR
- In WP(C)No.722/14 Mr. Z.A. Shah, Sr. Adv.
in IA 106824/18 Mr. Adil Asimi, Adv.
& WP(C) No.1268/19 Mr. Bilal Ahmad, Adv.
Mr. Hamid Shafi, Adv.
Mr. Anwar-ul-Islam, Adv.
Mr. Tufail Qadri, Adv.
Mr. Sanjay K. Chadda, Adv.
Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR
- In WP(C)No.1037/19 Ms. Archana Pathak Dave, AOR
for Intervenor
Mr. Satya Mitra, AOR
- In WP(C)No.1037/19 Mr. R.K. Raizada, Sr. Adv.
For Intervenor Mr. D.K. Dubey, Adv.
(IA 171690/19) Mr. Aditya Gaggar, Adv.
Mr. Sarthak Raizada, Adv.
Mr. Santosh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Vishal Arun, AOR
- In WP(C)No.722/14 Mr. Manoj K. Mishra, AOR
For Intervenor Mr. Umesh Dubey, Adv.
Mr. Jyoti Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Bheem Pratap Singh, Adv.
Mr. Sukumar, Adv.
- In WP(C)No.1013/19 Mr. Mahesh Thakur, AOR
For Intervenor
- In WP(C)No.722/14 Ms. Madhusmita Bora, AOR
For Impleader Mr. Riju Raj Singh Jamwal, Adv.
Mr. Pawan Kishore Singh, Adv.
- Intervenor-in-person
- IA No.10999/2020 Mr. Purushaindra Kaurav, Sr. Adv.
in WP No.1099/19 Mr. Apoorv Shukla, Adv.
Mr. Pattabhiram, Adv.
Mr. Santosh Kumar Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Apoorv Shukla, AOR
- Mr. K. Krishna Kumar, AOR
- In WP(C)No.1013/19 Mr. Ishwariprasad Bagaria, Adv.
For Intervenor Mr. Jog Singh, Adv.
Mr. Rahul G. Tanwani, Adv.
Mr. Manan Sanghai, Adv.
Mr. V.C. Shukla, Adv.
Mr. Prashant Singh, Adv.
Kanti, Adv.

Mr. Vinod Prajapati, Adv.
 Ms. Sindoor VNL, Adv.
 Ms. Aditi Tripathi, Adv.
 Ms. Seoula Vas, Adv.
 Mr. Parthsarathi Saraf, Adv.
 Mr. Tarun Gulia, Adv.
 Mr. Aishvary Vikram, Adv.
 Mr. Sushant Bajaj, Adv.
 Mr. Nitesh Ranjan, Adv.
 Mr. Anantha Narayana M.G., AOR

In WP(C)No.1013/19 For Impleader Mr. Abhimanyu Tewari, AOR

Mr. Irshad Ahmad, AOR

In WP(C)No.1013/19 For Intervenor Mr. P. S. Sudheer, AOR
 Mr. Bharat Sood, Adv.
 Mr. Rishi Maheshwari, Adv.
 Ms. Anne Mathew, Adv.
 Ms. Shruti Jose, Adv.

Ms. Adeeba Mujahid, AOR

Mr. R. D. Upadhyay, AOR

In WP(C)Nos.1013/19 & 1082/2019 For Impleader Mr. V. K. Biju, AOR
 Mr. Shaji George, Adv.
 Mr. Abhay Pratap Singh, Adv.

Mr. Sahil Tagotra, AOR

IA 189526/19 in WP No.1099/19 Mr. K. V. Muthu Kumar, AOR
 Mr. Ankit Tripathi, Adv.

IA 9596/2020 in WP (C) No.1037/19 Mr. Vinay Navare, Sr. Adv.
 Mr. Sandeep Singh, AOR
 Mr. Vishal Arun, Adv.
 Ms. Sarthak Raizada, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
 O R D E R

Arguments concluded on the preliminary issue.

The order is reserved.

(VISHAL ANAND)
 COURT MASTER (SH)
Cases cited:-

(RAJ RANI NEGI)
 ASSISTANT REGISTRAR

(2005) Volume II SCC 673 Para 12 at Page 682
 (1972) 1 SCC 872 Para 6

(1972) 1 SCC Page 536

(1970) AIR 1118 Para 4 at Page 1121

AIR 1962 SC 1288 Para 11

(1959) AIR SC 749 Para 10 at Page 758

(1969) 1 SCC 300 Para 7

