

ITEM NO.9

COURT NO.9

SECTION PIL-W

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Writ Petition(Civil) No.349/2006

VOLUNTARY HEALTH ASS. OF PUNJAB

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA . & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(IA No. 96313/2017 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/ DIRECTIONS, IA No. 110601/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION, IA No. 51190/2017 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION, IA No. 46/2017 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION, IA No. 140525/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION & IA No. 31554/2017 - IA FOR CLARIFICATION)

WITH

SLP(C) No. 3058/2020 (IV-C)

IA No. 6261/2022 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS, IA No.19193/2020, - EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT, IA No. 25054/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T., IA No. 19194/2020 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T., IA No. 6262/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T., IA No. 94056/2021 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT, IA No. 19192/2020 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES & IA No. 94060/2021 - VACATING STAY)

SLP(C) Nos. 1877-1917/2017 (XIV)

SLP(C) Nos. 34424-34425/2016 (XII)

SLP(C) Nos. 11046/2016 (XIV)

(IA No. 2/2016 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON)

SLP(C) Nos.34513-34517/2016 (IV-B)

(FOR [I/A FOR IMPLEADMENT] ON IA 38146/2017)

SLP(C) Nos. 30337-30338/2017 (XVI)

(IA No. 82766/2017 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT)

T.P.(C) Nos. 797-869/2017 (XVI-A)

(ONLY FOR STAY APPLICATION ON IA 137776/2021)

T.P.(C) No. 2459/2017 (XVI-A)

SLP(C) Nos.16657-16659/2016 (XIV)

Date : 19-01-2023 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SURYA KANT

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE J.K. MAHESHWARI

For Petitioner(s)

Ms. Meenakshi Arora, Sr. Adv.
 Mr. Kapil Joshi, Adv.
 Ms. Manju Sharma Jetley, AOR
 M/s. KNC

Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR
 Ms. Jyoti Mendiratta, AOR
 Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR

Mr. Vikramjeet Bajnerjee, Ld. ASG
 Mr. P.V. Yogeswaran, Adv.
 Mr. B.K. Satija, Adv.
 Mr. Navanjay Mahapatra, Adv.
 Mr. G.S. Makker, AOR

Mr. Percival Billimoria, Sr. Adv.
 Mr. Khowaja Siddiqui, Adv.
 Mr. Arup Sinha, Adv.
 Mr. Arvind Gupta, AOR

Mr. Vikas Singh, Sr. Adv.
 Mr. Shri Venkatesh, Adv.
 Ms. Kanika Chugh, Adv.
 Ms. Nishtha Kumar, AOR
 Mr. Bharat Gangadharan, Adv.
 Mr. Kartikey Trivedi, Adv.
 Mr. Siddharth Nigotia, Adv.
 Mr. Vasunavu, Adv.

Mr. Rajeev Singh, AOR

For Respondent(s)

Mr. K.M. Nataraj, Ld. ASG
 Mr. Neeraj Kumar Sharma, Adv.
 Ms. Priyanka Sharma, Adv.
 Mr. Prahil Sharma, Adv.
 Mr. Harender Singh, Adv.
 Mr. Ambuj Saraswat, Adv.
 Mr. Prabhat Pachauri, Adv.
 Mr. Shreekant N. Terdal, AOR

Mr. K.M. Nataraj, Ld. ASG
 Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv.
 Mr. Bhuvan Kapoor, Adv.
 Mr. Vatsal Joshi, Adv.
 Ms. Neeraj Kr. Sharma, Adv.
 Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makkar, Adv.

Mr. Satyakam, Adv.
 Ms. Pallavi Singh, Adv.

Mr. Sanakam, AOR

Mr. Praveen Agrawal, AOR
Ms. C. K. Sucharita, AOR
Mr. Abhishth Kumar, AOR

Mr. Puneet Jain, Adv.
Ms. Christi Jain, Adv.
Mr. Umang Mehta, Adv.
Mr. Yogit Kamat, Adv.
Ms. Shruti Singh, Adv.
Mr. Mann Arora, Adv.
Ms. Pratibha Jain, AOR

Mr. Avijit Bhattacharjee, AOR
Mr. P. V. Dinesh, AOR

Mr. Vikas Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Shri Venkatesh, Adv.
Ms. Kanika Chugh, Adv.
Ms. Nishtha Kumar, AOR
Mr. Bharat Gangadharan, Adv.
Mr. Kartikey Trivedi, Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Nigotia, Adv.
Mr. Vasunavu, Adv.

Mr. Arun K. Sinha, AOR
Mr. P. V. Yogeswaran, AOR
Mr. Chandra Prakash, AOR
Mr. Jatinder Kumar Bhatia, AOR
Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR
Mr. Rajesh Srivastava, AOR

Mr. Sudhir Walia, Adv.
Ms. Niharika Ahluwalia, AOR
Ms. Ishita Deswal, Adv.

Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR
Ms. Limayinla Jamir, Adv.
Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.
Ms. Chubalemla Chang, Adv.
Mr. Prang Newmai, Adv.

M/s. Corporate Law Group, AOR
Mr. Jay Kishor Singh, AOR

Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR
Mr. D.C. Yadav, A.A.G.
Dr. Sukhdev Sharma, Adv.
Mr. A.S. Rishi, Adv.

Mr. Ishwar Chand, Adv.

Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR
Mr. Md. Apzal Ansari, Adv.

Mr. B. Balaji, AOR

Mr. Upendra Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, Adv.
Mr. Ranjan Mukherjee, AOR

Mr. Mahfooz A. Nazki, AOR
Mr. Polanki Gowtham, Adv.
Mr. Shaik Mohamad Haneef, Adv.
Mr. T. Vijaya Bhaskar Reddy, Adv.
Mr. K.V. Girish Chowdary, Adv.
Ms. Rajeswari Mukherjee, Adv.
Ms. Niti Richhariya, Adv.

Mr. D. Mahesh Babu, AOR
Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR

Mr. Sumeer Sodhi, AOR
Mr. Dhruv Wadhwa, Adv.

Ms. G. Indira, AOR

Mr. Neeraj S. Mathew, Adv.
Mr. Hitesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr. S.K. Rajora, Adv.
Mr. Akhileshwar Jha, Adv.
Ms. Niharika Dewivedi, Adv.
Ms. Yamini Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Vijay Pal, Adv.
Mr. Anil Shrivastav, AOR

Mr. Ashutosh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr. J.K. Bhatia, AOR

Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR
Mr. Arvind Kumar Sharma, AOR
Ms. Pragati Neekhara, AOR
Mr. Anil Kumar Jha, AOR

Dr. Manish Singhvi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Arpit Parkash, Adv.
Mr. Vikalp Sharma, Adv.

Dr. Manish Singhvi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR

Mr. Arpit Parkash, Adv.
Ms. Shubhangi Agarwal, Adv.

Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR
Mr. Gaurav Kejriwal, AOR
Mrs. B. Sunita Rao, AOR
Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, AOR

Mr. Vikrajit Benerajee, Ld. ASG
Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR
Mr. Wasim Qadri, Adv.
Mr. P.V. Yogeshwaran, Adv.
Mr. Navanjay Mahapatra, Adv.
Mr. Rajesh Ranjan, Adv.
Ms. Sunita Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Albhaya Dhamija, Adv.
Ms. Priyanka Das, Adv.
Mr. Sudhakar Kulwant, Adv.
Mr. Prashant Rawat, Adv.
Mr. Tathagat Sharma, Adv.
Mr. B.K. Satija, Adv.

Mr. P. N. Gupta, AOR
Mr. T. V. George, AOR
Mr. Kamini Jaiswal, AOR
Mr. T. Harish Kumar, AOR
Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR

Mr. Ashok K. Parija, Adv.
Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR

Mr. Ankur S. Kulkarni, AOR
Ms. Uttara Babbar, AOR

Mr. Mohan Lal Sharma, AOR
Ms. Shikha Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Rajbir Singh, Adv.

Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR
Mr. Akshay C. Shrivatava, Adv.
Mrs. Bihu Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Pratishtha Vij, Adv.

Mr. Shivam Singh, Adv.
Mr. Manish Kumar, AOR

Mr. Gagan Gupta, AOR
Caveator-in-person

Mr. Dinesh Chandra Yadav, Adv.

Mr. Samar Vijay Singh, AOR
Mr. Ishwar Chand, Adv.
Ms. Amrita Verma, Adv.
Ms. Sabarni Som, Adv.
Mr. Keshav Mittal, Adv.

Ms. Nupur Kumar, AOR

Mr. Parijat Kishore, AOR
M/s. PLR Chambers And Co., AOR

Mr. Chander Shekhar Ashri, AOR
Mr. Gyanender Rathour, Adv.

Mr. Smarhar Singh, AOR
Mr. Pallav Mongia, AOR

Mr. C. K. Sasi, AOR
Mr. Abdulla Naseeh V T, Adv.
Ms. Meena K Poullose, Adv.

Ms. Chitrangda Rastravara, Adv.
Mr. Manvendra Singh, Adv.
Mr. Dashrath Singh, Adv.
Mr. Abhijeet Singh, Adv.
Mr. Gp. Capt. Karan Singh Bhati, AOR

Mr. Gaurav Sharma, AOR
Mr. Dhawal Mohan, Adv.
Mr. Prateek Bhatia, Adv.
Mr. Manoj Rajput, Adv.
Mr. Paranjay Tripathi, Adv.

Mr. Shubhranshu Padhi, AOR
Mr. Vishal Bansal, Adv.
Mrs. Rajeshwari Shankar, Adv.
Mr. Niroop Sukirthy, Adv.
Mr. Ovais Md., Adv.

Mr. Dinkar Kalra, AOR
Mr. Rajeev Singh, AOR

Mr. Gopal Shankarnarayan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. S.r. Raghunathan, Adv.
Mr. S. Santanam Swaminadhan, Adv.
Ms. Abhilasha Shrawat,, Adv.
Ms. Abhilasha Shrawat, Adv.
Mr. Kartik Malhotra, Adv.
Mr. Darsh Bansal, Adv.
Ms. Ishita Chowdhury, Adv.

Mr. Anindit Mandal, Adv.
Mrs. Aarthi Rajan, AOR

Mr. Satyakam, AOR

Mr. Devendra Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Prem Sunder Jha, AOR

Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR
Mr. Ravinder Singh, Adv.
Mr. Srisatya Mohanty, Adv.
Ms. Raveesha Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Mantika Haryani, Adv.
Mr. Sanjeev Kaushik Adv.
Mr. Shreyas Awasthi, Adv.
Mr. Himanshu Chakravarty, Adv.
Mr. Devvrat Singh, Adv.
Ms. Muskan Surana, Adv.

Mr. Pramod Dayal, AOR

Mr. P.V. Yogeshwaran, AAG
Mr. Sunny Choudhary, AOR
Mr. Aakash Nandolia, Adv.

Mr. Gautam Kumar Laha, Adv.
Mr. Venkatkrishna Kunduru, Adv.
Ms. Kiran Mahato, Adv.
Mr. Praveen Agrawal, AOR

Dr. Ashwani Kumar, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Rashmi Nandakumar, AOR
Ms. Sanskriti Bharadwaj, Adv.

Mr. Pushpinder Singh, Adv.
Ms. Hemlata Rao Singh, Adv.
Ms. Anurag Rana, Adv.
Ms. Shalini Kaul, AOR

Ms. Deepanwita Priyanka, AOR

Mr. Vikas Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Shri Venkatesh, Adv.
Ms. Kanika Chugh, Adv.
Ms. Nishtha Kumar, AOR
Mr. Bharat Gangadharan, Adv.
Mr. Kartikey Trivedi, Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Nigotia, Adv.
Mr. Vasunavu, Adv.

Mr. Nishe Rajen Shonker, AOR
Mrs. Anu K Joy, Adv.
Mr. Alim Anvar, Adv.

Mr. Gopal Shankarnarayan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. S.r. Raghunathan, Adv.
Mr. S. Santanam Swaminadhan, Adv.
Ms. Abhilasha Shrawat,, Adv.
Ms. Abhilasha Shrawat, Adv.
Mr. Kartik Malhotra, Adv.
Mr. Darsh Bansal, Adv.
Ms. Ishita Chowdhury, Adv.
Mr. Anindit Mandal, Adv.
Mrs. Aarthi Rajan, AOR

Mr. Atul Sharma, AOR
Ms. Ranjeeta Rohatgi, AOR

Mr. Vikrakjit Benerajee, Ld. ASG
Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR
Mr. S. Wasim A. Qadri, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Rajesh Ranjan, Adv.
Ms. Sunita Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Albhaya Dhamija, Adv.
Ms. Priyanka Das, Adv.

Mr. Aruneshwar Gupta, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Himanshu Chaturvedi, Adv.
Mr. Rajeev Singh, AOR
Mr. Abhishek Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Rajeev Singh, AOR
Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR

Mr. Aprajit Singh, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Shashi Kiran, AOR
Mr. Rohit Pandey, Adv.
Mr. V. Dwivedi, Adv.
Mr. Vaibhav Maheshwari, Adv.
Mr. Arjun Sain, Adv.
Ms. Manisha Anand, Adv.
Mr. Anshuman D., Adv.
Ms. Richa Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Rohit Gautam, Adv.
Mr. Adhyayan Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Sangeeta Bhalla, Adv.

Ms. Adarsh Nain, AOR

Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR
Mr. Akshay C. Shrivatava, Adv.
Mrs. Bihu Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Pratishtha Vij, Adv.

Mr. Sanjay Parikh, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Srishti Agnihotri, AOR
Mr. Satwik Parikh, Adv.
Ms. Sanjana Grace Thomas, Adv.
Ms. Mantika Vohra, Adv.

Mr. Aravindh S., AOR
Mr. A.laxshminarayanan, Adv.
Mr. Abbas B., Adv.

Ms. Pratibha Jain, AOR
Mr. C. K. Rai, AOR

Mr. Nirnimesh Dube, AOR
Mr. Siddhesh Kotwal, Adv.
Mr. Nihar Dharmadhikari, Adv.
Ms. Sampreeti Baksi, Adv.

Ms. Manisha T. Karia, AOR
Ms. Nidhi Nagpal, Adv.
Mr. Adarsh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Kesar, Adv.

Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR
Mr. Karun Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Anupam Ngangom, Adv.
Mr. Wahengbam Immanuel Meitei, Adv.

Mr. Madhvi S. Sawant, Adv.
Ms. Shweta Sand, Adv.
Mr. Narendra Pal Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Ravish Kumar Goyal, Adv.
Mr. Nitin Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Anil Kumar Chawla, Adv.
Mr. Vinod Kumar, Adv.
Ms. Manju Jetley, AOR

Dr. Ashwani Kumar, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Rashmi Nandakumar, AOR
Ms. Sanskriti Bharadwaj, Adv.

Ms. Diksha Rai, Adv.
Ms. Ragini Pandey, AOR

Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR

Mr. T.K. Nayak, Adv.
Ms. Marbiang Khongwir, Adv.

Ms. Garima Verma, Adv.
Mr. Vijay Singh, Adv.
Mr. Ashwini Kumar, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

1. We have heard learned Senior counsel appearing for the parties briefly.
2. It is stated on behalf of the respondents that the issues raised in these petitions have already been effectively answered by a three-Judge Bench of this Court vide order dated 14-03-2018 in Special Leave Petition (Civil) Nos.16657-16659 of 2016 - "Union of India Versus Indian Radiological And Imaging Association and Ors. Etc.) Reported in (2018) 5 SCC 773. However, according to the petitioners, the above-stated order is interim in nature.
3. On consideration of the proposed issues, it appears to us that it will be more appropriate if such issues are also considered by a three-Judge Bench.
4. Consequently, the Registry is directed to place the matters before Hon'ble the Chief Justice of India to constitute/assign these matters to a three-Judge Bench at the earliest.

(VISHAL ANAND)
ASTT. REGISTRAR-cum-PS

(PREETHI T.C.)
COURT MASTER (NSH)