

Item Nos. 07&08

(Court No. 1)

**BEFORE THE NATIONAL GREEN TRIBUNAL
PRINCIPAL BENCH, NEW DELHI**

(By Video Conferencing)

Review Application No. 17/2022
IN
Original Application No. 214/2021
(I.A. No. 154/2022)

Shailesh Singh Applicant

Versus

Central Pollution Control Board & Ors. Respondent

Municipal Corporation of Delhi Review Applicant

WITH

M.A. No. 39/2022
In
Original Application No. 214/2021

Shailesh Singh Applicant

Versus

Central Pollution Control Board & Ors. Respondent

M/s QURESHI INTL. DS-MAX
FNF CONSORTIUM PVT. LTD. Applicant in M.A. 39/2022

Date of hearing: 04.07.2022

**CORAM: HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ADARSH KUMAR GOEL, CHAIRPERSON
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SUDHIR AGARWAL, JUDICIAL MEMBER
HON'BLE PROF. A. SENTHIL VEL, EXPERT MEMBER**

Review Applicant: Mr. Aman Lekhi, Senior Advocate with Mr. Manu Chaturvedi, Adv.
for Review Applicant (Municipal Corporation of Delhi)

Respondent: Mr. Narender Pal Singh, Adv. for DPCC

Mr. S.A. Zaidi and Ms. Mansi Chahal, Advocates for M/s
Frigorifico Allana Pvt. Ltd.

Mr. A.D.N. Rao, Senior Advocate with Mr. Rahul Mishra, Advocate
for Applicant (M/s Qureshi Intl. DS-MAX FNF Consortium Pvt.
Ltd.) in M.A. 39/2022

ORDER

Review Application No. 17/2022

1. This application seeks review of order dated 13.05.2022 directing
as follows:-

“1to6....xxx.....xxx.....xxx

7. From the above, it is seen that while ETP is said to be now working with the proposed Irrigation Management Plan for use of treated water, **treated water is being used for suppression of dust, action has been initiated for illegal extraction of groundwater without permission of DJB which is the competent authority**, four borewells have been sealed, borewell water was being used for floor washing and tanker water was being used for meat washing. Thus, it remains undisputed that **there is no availability of water, if illegal extraction of groundwater is to be discontinued**. Though the report of DPCC mentions that validity of consent exists till 13.09.2022, it has not been made clear whether the consent conditions are complied. In fact **non compliance is shown by illegal extraction of groundwater in area which is ‘Over Exploited’ in terms of availability of groundwater**.

8. In view of above, we direct that the **PP may not be allowed to operate the plant unless a Joint Committee of CPCB and DPCC certifies that the project can be operated in accordance with the consent conditions and environmental norms. In case the project is to be permitted, the Committee may ensure 100% recirculation of treated water and the adoption of ZLD system**. The statutory regulators may fix accountability for past violations, following due process of law. Payment of assessed compensation, to be used for restoration of the environment, will be condition precedent for permitting the project.”

2. Case set out in the review application is that non compliance in respect of NOC from DJB for extraction of ground water and other non compliances have since been remedied and 100% recirculation of treated water planned but adoption of ZLD may not be possible forthwith and the

same will be ensured in due course except for direct contact with the meat.

3. On the issue of ground water, it is stated that the DJB has, on further consideration, allowed extraction of ground water vide letter dated 24.05.2022 as follows:

“1. Special permission.in the matter of regularization of 05 Nos. bore wells installed at Gazipur Slaughter House for abstracting the ground water for operation and maintenance of Ghazipur Slaughter House, Rendering Plant and Livestock Market.

*Dy Commissioner (Health), EDMÇ vide letter dt 20.05.2022 requested DM East and Chairman DAC to accord special permission to regularize 05 Nos. bore wells installed at Gazipur Slaughter House for abstracting the ground water for operation and maintenance of Ghazipur Slaughter House, Rendering Plant and Livestock Market to comply NGT orders dt 13.05.2022. The representative of CGWB reported that the advisory committee can give permission for other than domestic purposes, Accordingly, **the advisory committee after detailed deliberation provisionally granted special permission to regularize 5 Nos bore wells Initially for a period of 6 months subject to maximum abstraction of 180 KLD per bore with installation of telemetric flow meter on each bore and its id and Password will shared with CGWB with other terms & conditions as attached.”***

4. With regard to other violations, found in the report dated 24.01.2022 and status report dated 02.05.2022, inspection was conducted on 31.05.2022 with reference to following stand of the review applicant:

“xxxxxx.....xxx

xxxix. In a preliminary response to Respondent nos.1 and 2's orally conveyed observations, the Review Applicant issued communication on the same day (31.05.2022) to the Respondent no.2 explicitly stating as follows:

- a. Necessary permission for regularisation of 5 bore wells had been obtained from the DJB.*

- b. Telemetric flow meter has also been installed by the Lessee at the relevant site.
- c. Treated water from ETP is being re-used for various purposes and there is no discharge of water in the drain (thus, broadly meeting the requirement of ZLD).
- d. Non-withdrawal of Respondent no.1's revocation order will lead to rampant illegal slaughtering activities all over Delhi and present serious health hazards, which cannot be controlled.
- e. Closure of Ghazipur Slaughterhouse and rendering plant will massively detonate the sanitary and public health conditions in Delhi, due to unattended putrefied dead animals scattered all over Delhi, which are otherwise 'scientifically disposed at the rendering plant.
- f. The Review Applicant is under a statutory obligation to lift animals and process them scientifically in the rendering plant.

xl. The Review Applicant filed WP(C) no.9467/2022 before the Delhi High Court of Delhi impugning Respondent no.2's sudden and arbitrary order revoking the Consent to Operate for Ghazipur Slaughterhouse. The Hon`ble High Court was pleased to dispose of the petition while noting that this Hon'ble Tribunal impugned order had not been challenged and directing the Respondent no.2 to conduct fresh inspection as and when requested by the Review Applicant to do so.

xli. On 08.06.2022, the Delhi Meat Merchants Association issued communication to Review Applicant stating therein that due to closure of Ghazipur Slaughterhouse, which fulfils meat demand of approximately 70% of Delhi's population, livelihoods of Meat Shop owners, butchers, farmers supplying live animals to the Ghazipur Slaughterhouse and sundry daily wagers attached to the meat business has been vastly affected and they are on brink of starvation. It was further stated that supply of meat to the armed forces and foreign embassies had also come to a halt, along with closure of allied sectors like hide, offal, poultry feed supplement, horn hooves, animal fat domestic business(es).

xlii. Accordingly, between 09.06.2022 and 10.06.2022, the Review Applicant reviewed and compiled information capturing impact of closure of Ghazipur Slaughterhouse on functioning of meat shops.

xliii. On 13.06.2022, In further comprehensive response to Respondent no.2's oral suggestions given pursuant to inspection dt. 31.05.2022, the Review Applicant issued communication highlighting the following:

- a. With the exception of 2 issues — installation of ZLD system and dung/ingesta drying unit — the Review Applicant had successfully addressed/remedied all other alleged deficiencies observed during inspection;
- b. The Review Applicant had engaged CSIR-National Environmental Engineering Research Institute (**CSIR-**

- NEERI'**) in order to assess and render advise regarding the installation of the ZLD system and dung/ingesta drying unit;
- c. CSIR-NEERI officials inspected the Ghazipur Slaughterhouse premises on 07.06.2022 and held detailed discussions with the Review Applicant and Lessee regarding objectives/scope of work involving feasibility of ZLD system and management of animal dung;
 - d. CSIR-NEERI was of the opinion that that the efficacy/ need of ZLD system could only be determined after the Ghazipur Slaughterhouse became operational at normal capacity;
 - e. CSIR-NEERI will need to observe the functioning of the current systems at Ghazipur Slaughterhouse premises, along with implementation of NEERI's suggestions for a period of 3 months.
 - f. CSIR-NEERI's Initial Assessment Report would thereafter be prepared within 4 months;
 - g. Installation of ZLD system, if found to be efficacious, would take 6-8 months or more and will be undertaken by a professional agency.
 - h. In the meantime, the Review Applicant would manage animal dung by having the same transported to 9 of its Green Waste Management Centres located across NCR, for use by Horticulture Department for composting;
 - i. Since 2009, the Review Applicant has time and again invited tenders for establishment of bio-methanation plant, but the same has not materialised due to non-reception of bids or due to single bidder situation, and thereafter, due to non-execution of concession agreement by successful bidder in 2014 (which was communicated to Respondent no.2 on 23.04.2019);
 - j. Tender for bio-methanation plant was once again floated on 26.10.2021 and despite 6 extensions being granted for submitting bids (extended till 17.02.2022), no bids were received. Therefore, bid was finally closed on 24.02.2022;
 - k. Requesting waiver of environmental compensation amount of Rs.50 lacs levied on the Review Applicant due to acute financial crunch that had also resulted in unification of the three Corporation, including erstwhile EDMC; and
 - I. In light of the above, requesting withdrawal of Order revoking Consent to Operate for Ghazipur Slaughter house.

xliv. However, the Respondent no.2 continues to cite the impugned order and insist that installation of ZLD system is a pre-condition for allowing operation of the Ghazipur Slaughterhouse and withdrawal of the Respondent no.2's revocation order, despite the same being a) not mandatory in law; and b) CSIR-NEERI's clear stand that a feasibility study of the ZLD system can only be ascertained once the Ghazipur

Slaughterhouse is allowed to operate at normal capacity and NEERI's suggestions are implemented on the current system.

5. The review application came up for hearing on 01.07.2022. Noting that report dated 20.06.2022 has been filed by CPCB and DPCC in pursuance of order dated 13.05.2022 to which objections have been filed by the applicant on 01.07.2022, the matter was posted for consideration today after information to all the parties by e-mail.

6. The report filed by the DPCC is that it has revoked the consent to operate granted to M/s Delhi Food Processing Complex (Meat), Ghazipur. It is further stated that inspection was carried out on 31.05.2022 and status of compliance was found to be as follows:

S. No.	Short-comings observed during joint inspection held on 29.09.2021	Compliance Status as observed by Joint Committee during joint inspection dated 31.05.2022
1	ETP of the unit was not functioning properly. The MLSS level in the aeration tank was found very low (Aeration Tank1- 361 and Aeration Tank2- 680 mg/ l). Dissolved Air Flotation unit (DAF) and UASB unit of ETP were found not functioning.	Since the unit was closed. No effluent Was coming to the units of ETP. However, MLSS levels in both the aeration tanks was observed to be adequate. Copy of the lab report dated 12.04.2022 from DPCC Water Laboratory is attached as Annexure-I .
2	There is not digital flow meter at outlet of ETP for measuring flow of the treated effluent. There is also no record maintained for utilization of treated effluent in horticulture. However, analog flow meter is provided.	Digital Flow meters have been installed at the desired locations.
3	The unit does not have Irrigation Management Agriculture Plan approved by University/ Irrigation Department.	Irrigation Management plan prepared by CSAUAT, Kanpur submitted by the unit on 01.04.2022. As informed by the PP, the treated wastewater is being transported by tankers to the parks of MCD for horticulture as the unit does not have irrigation land. The unit has also not provided the details of treated effluent which is used for horticulture purpose.
4	During the inspection, the unit could not show final discharge point of treated effluent. The claim Hof the unit that the treated waste water is utilized for horticulture in SLF could not be shown by the unit and verified by the inspecting team.	Final discharge point was identified at the landfill site. Also, a treated effluent filling station has been made for MCD tankers within premises. The unit has made temporary arrangements for transport of treated water to the landfill site through flexible pipelines. h u observed that the treated water was coming back into the drain, which is

		passing through the road on front side of the unit. There is no horticulture network established by the unit at the site of SLF.
5	There is no NOC from Delhi Jal Board for abstraction of water from ground.	Obtained permission for 05 Bore wells temporarily for a period of 6 months, extendable to 2 years from the Competent Authority (Annexure-II).
6	Although the unit has installed OCEMS, however, no calibration certificate was found with the unit.	Calibration certificate of OLMS has been submitted to DPCC.
7	The ground water samples were collected from 03 locations within the premises and nearby area. The analysis report shows Total Coliform/Fecal Coliform presence in the ground water exceeding the standard at 02 locations.	The bore wells exceeding the standards have been sealed by the concerned SDM.
8	The consent issued does not specify the nos, of animals to be slaughtered on daily basis and capacity of by-products. It does not direct the unit also to utilize treated effluent as per the guidelines framed by CPCB for "utilization of treated effluent in irrigation" in compliance 'of Hon'ble NGT order.	The consent was given to the unit based on the number of animals specified in the consent application by EDMC.
9	The unit should put up mechanized dewatering machine for quick drying of the sludge.	Two Centrifuge pumps were found to be in working condition to separate water from the sludge. It has been observed that extracted water from the sludge, was going into the drain instead of the ETP.
10	The unit may engage any expert institution for adequacy assessment and up-gradation of its ETP so as the effluent treated properly.	Adequacy report prepared by Jamia Millia Islamia University, Delhi has been submitted to DPCC. However, it does not specify about up-gradation of the ETP so that the effluent is treated properly.

Table 2: Compliance status of terms and conditions stipulated in the Consent to Operate (CTO) on 31.05.2022

S. No.	Terms and conditions	Compliance Status
1	The consentee shall make possible efforts to reuse the entire treated effluent generated after the treatment of industrial waste water from the ETP.	- Filling station has been made for MCD tankers to transport the treated wastewater to Ghazipur Sanitary Landfill site of MCD adjacent to the slaughter house. - Treated effluent is being sprinkled the Ghazipur landfill. - The unit has made temporary arrangements for transport of treated water to the landfill site through flexible pipelines. - Oil and Grease trapping system installed.
2	The Consentee shall make suitable arrangement for collection & storage of treated effluent and its pumping with the pipe line system up to Ghazipur SLF area for horticulture purposes at SLF area and other nearby areas.	
3	The consentee shall submit analysis report for all above seven parameters in the	
		Adequacy report obtained from Jamie Millis Islamia University submitted to DPCC. Said report consists of test

	treated trade effluent discharge from the unit from DPCC approved laboratory every three months.	report.
4	The consentee shall submit stack monitoring report of boiler and noise monitoring reports of DO set(s) from approved laboratory of DPCC every six months.	• Converted boiler to PNG based fuel. • Noise monitoring report of DO set submitted to DPCC.
5	The consentee shall comply with the conditions given in Consent to Establish & Consent to Operate issued by DPCC and shall also comply with all the provisions and conditions imposed by the Ministry of Environment & Forests in its Environmental Clearance.	Complying except for: • installation of bio-methanation plant. • Proper network for treated wastewater in horticulture. • Reuse of treated wastewater within' the process.
6	The consentee shall also follow orders/ judgements of Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, on the issue of Slaughter House most particularly passed in W.P (C) 309/2003 & 1 A No. 22&40 in civil Appeal No. 379 of 199 time to time, in addition to above conditions, if any.	State level Committee headed by Pr. Secretary (UD) has been constituted and regular meetings are being taken. Sub-Committee has been constituted by the State Level Committee which is carrying out regular inspections of the unit.

In compliance of directions of the Hon'ble NGT dated 13.05.2021 the slaughter house is yet to adopt Zero Liquid Discharge (ZLD) system and 100 % recirculation technology for treatment of trade effluent generated by the Slaughter House.

As requested by MCD vide letter dated 09.06.2022, the Joint Committee consisting officials from CPCB and DPCC officials namely YN Mishra, Scientist-C, CPCB, and RK Sharma, EE, DPCC inspected the Slaughter House again on 10.06.2022 to verify the claim of MCD regarding removal of the short-comings found on 31.05.2022 (**Annexure-III**).

Table 3: Compliance based on Inspection dated 10.06.2022 for short-comings observed during Joint Inspection held on 29.09.2021

S. No.	Short-comings observed during joint inspection held on 29.09.2021	Compliance Status as observed by Joint Committee during joint inspection dated 10.06.2022
3	The unit does not have Irrigation Management Agriculture Plan approved by University / Irrigation Department.	Irrigation Management plan prepared by CSAUAT, Kanpur submitted by the union 01.04.2022. As informed by the PP, the treated waste is being transported by tankers to the parks of MCD for horticulture as the unit does not have irrigation land. The unit shall maintain logbook for quantity of treated effluent being used for such purposes.
4	During the inspection, the unit could not show final discharge point of treated effluent. The claim of the unit that the	Final discharge point was identified landfill at the site. Also, a treated effluent filling station has been made for MCD tankers within premises.

	<i>treated waste water is utilized for horticulture in SLF could not be shown by the unit and verified by the inspecting team.</i>	<i>The unit has made permanent arrangements for transport of treated water to the landfill site through rigid GI pipeline.</i> <i>A total of 20 sprinklers have been installed at the landfill site for utilization of treated effluent. However, a dedicated manpower may be employed to control ponding around this network. Photograph of the sprinkling System is attached as Annexure-IV.</i>
8	<i>The consent issued does not specify the numbers of animals to be slaughtered on daily basis and capacity of by-products. It does not direct the unit also to utilize treated effluent as per the guidelines framed by CPCB for "utilization of treated effluent in irrigation" in compliance of Hon'ble NGT order.</i>	<i>The consent was given to the unit based on the number of animals specified in the consent application by EDMC.</i>
9	<i>The unit should put up mechanized dewatering machine for quick drying of the sludge.</i>	<i>Two Centrifuge pumps were found to be in working condition to separate water from the sludge. The filtrate is collected and taken to ETP. The unit should maintain logbook for sludge disposal.</i>

Comments and observations:

- *The Slaughter House is yet to adopt Zero Liquid Discharge (ZLD) system for wastewater treatment and 100% recirculation of the treated wastewater in compliance of the Hon'ble NGT order dated 13.05.2022.*
- *The bio-methanation plant has not been installed for handling and treatment of ingesta and dung.*
- *The DPCC has imposed Environmental Compensation (EC) of Rs. 50 Lakhs for non-installation bio-methanation plant on MCD, which is yet to be deposited.*
- *A skilled worker(s) may be deputed for the task to monitor working of sprinklers installed at the Ghazipur landfill site to control ponding due to water.*
- *The construction of oil and grease trap water was found under progress.*

The MCD has submitted a letter 07.06.2022 along with copy of proposal received for study of waste water treatment system (ETP) with feasibility of its ZLD system from NEERI. It has also submitted a copy of agreement with Animal Dung Management at Ghazipur Slaughter House, Delhi regarding transportation of dung generated in lairage and livestock to 09 green waste management centres of MCD. The MCD vide its letter dated 09:06:2022 submitted that NEERI will submit a report to

MCD within two-three days regarding installation of dung/ingesta drying unit.

The MCD has requested DPCC vide its letter dated 13.06.2022 to waive off the EC of Rs. 50 Lakhs and requested to allow the operation of the Ghazipur Slaughter House with its normal slaughtering capacity as it is required for conducting the study by CSIR-NEERI (Annexure-V Colly).

Conclusion:

The inspection of the Slaughter House was carried out jointly by CPCB, DPCC and others in compliance with the Hon'ble NGT order dated 13.05.2022. The conclusion made by the Committee based on the inspections and information shared by the MCD as under:

- a) The unit has convention effluent treatment plant consisting of primary, secondary and tertiary treatment units. No effluent was coming to ETP during the inspection as the plant was closed by the DPCC in compliance of Hon'ble NGT order. However, MLSS level in the aeration tanks (2 Nos) was observed adequate.*
- b) The unit has made arrangement for utilization of treated effluent for horticulture and dust suppression purpose at Ghazipur SLF site by providing GI pipeline and 20 sprinkles. The treated water is also used in horticulture within premises. However, the unit has not reported any recycle and reuse of treated waste water within the process. The Slaughter House is yet to adopt Zero Liquid Discharge (ZLD) system. The Unit has invited a proposal from NEERI for Study of their ETP and feasibility of achieving ZLD. NEERI has sought 4 months' time for such study and a precondition of operation of plant.*
- c) The unit has not installed bio-methanation plant for handling of ingesta/dung waste. Now as per information shared, the unit is exploring deploying of dung/ingesta drying unit through NEERI and a report in this regard shall be submitted within 2-3 days.*
- d) For quick drying of the sludge two centrifuge pumps were found to be in working condition to separate water from the sludge. The filtrate is collected and taken to ETP for further treatment.*
- e) Flow meter devices have been installed at 4 nos of borewell and at ETP outlet. The operator has informed that MCD directed it vide letter dated 07.06.2022 to transport the dung from the plant to 09 green waste management centres of MCD located in east Delhi for use in compost making.*
- f) The MCD has not deposited Environmental Compensation imposed by DPCC for non-compliance of bio-methanation plant installation till date.”*

7. Objections of the applicant are that:

“14. *The aforesaid inspection report given by the Respondent DPCC is not satisfactory to the applicant for other following reason:*

- i. That there is no proof of inspection provided along with the inspection report. No C.C.T.V. footage in a compact disk along with additional details is provided.*
- ii. The nearby villagers/residing locals, who were aggrieved by the acts off this unit, their objections, Suggestions and recommendations were not mentioned in the inspection report. The applicant would like state herein that the inspection done by the officers is a mere documentation.*
- iii. The inspection done is not in accordance with the order passed by this Hon’ble Tribunal or not in accordance with the allegations put up by the applicant.*
- iv. The respondent unit is causing damage to the entire area since long still the govt. agencies have not taken any step against respondent unit, have not filed any case/complaint under Air and Water Act, knowing the fact that violation of air and water act is a punishable offence.*
- v. The inspection committee/govt. agencies have not rejected the NOCs issued under air and water act to respondent unit.*
- vi. The official respondents have failed to comply with the directions issued by this Hon’ble Tribunal 28 months back and nor taken any action against the respondent unit which is a punishable offence under Section 26,27 and 28 of the NGT Act”*

8. Letter of the MCD dated 01.07.2022 by way of further submissions in the review application mentions that RO system followed by nano filtration system has been planned. ZLD can be followed except for using it with meat contact. On account of non-functioning of slaughter house, 70% meat shops have been closed adversely affecting 60,000 – 80,000 workers. This may also lead to illegal slaughtering of animals in view of approaching *id-ul-Zuha* (Bakrid) on 10.07.2022. The submissions in the letter are as follows:

“It is humbly submitted that the Hon’ble NGT vide order dated 13.05.2022 in the matter of Shailesh Singh Vs. Central Pollution Control Board & Ors. (OA No. 214/2021) has passed the directions “That the PP may not be allowed to operate the plant unless a joint committee of CPCB and DPCC certifies that the project can be

operated in accordance with the consent conditions and environmental norms. In case the project is to be permitted, that committee may ensure 100% re-circulation of treated water and the adoption of ZLD system.

2. That In view of above directions, M.C.D. has approached CSIR-National Environmental Engineering Research Institute (NEERI) who after inspection of Ghazipur slaughter house on 07.06.2022 has worked out following objectives and scope of work.

- (A) To ensure functioning of ETP according to the environmental compliance norms*
- (B) To examine the possibility/feasibility of Zero Liquid Discharge (ZLD), and*
- (C) The management of animal dung produced from the slaughter house.*

The copy of the Project Proposal dated 10.6.2022 sent to the MCD by NEERI is enclosed herewith as Annexure "A" for reference.

3. The CSIR-NEERI vide its report has communicated following time line for various activities to be undertaken to take the action on above issues.

- (a) Initial Assessment Report will be submitted to MCD by NEERI within 4 months*
- (b) After implementation of NEERI suggested measures by MCD, post implementation monitoring/assessment by NEERI will take 3 months.*
- (c) In case a ZLD system is to be installed, it may take about 6-8 months' time (or more) as this work will be done by a professional agency to be engaged by the MCD.*

4. That NEERI under point No. 3 (C) in its above report has also mentioned that in order to conduct the above study, the Ghazipur Slaughter House plant needs to be in operation at its normal capacity. The NEERI has informed that it will submit a report to the MCD after detailed study of feasibility to maintain the ZLD at Ghazipur Slaughter House. After getting the report/suggestion from NEERI, the MCD will implement/execute the system of ZLD at Ghazipur Slaughter House within one year after receiving the report.

5. It is further submitted that the water to be generated at ETP is being used for the purposes of washing & cleaning of floor of Slaughter House, Lairage, dispatch area, dust suppressions and gardening through sprinklers at SLF, horticulture purpose in MCD parks through tankers.

6. That MCD is using bore wells with due permission of the Delhi Jal Board vide letter dated 24.05.2022. MCD is also planning to reduce extraction of water through bore

wells to 40-50% by implementation of RO systems followed by nano filtration system at Ghazipur Slaughter house after conducting a feasibility study. We humbly submit that recovered water (after the process of Adsorption/Reverse Osmosis/Ultrafiltration with disinfection) will be difficult for use in the process on account of public health hygiene. This water certainly will be used for other purpose. Therefore, we will adopt processes involved in ZLD except using it with meat contact. Further, as per ground water report (2020-21), the location in Question i.e., Ghazipur Slaughter House falls in semi critical block.

7. *That about 70% meat shops have closed down due to non-functioning of Ghazipur Slaughter House. As a result, about 60,000-80,000 workers/ livestock traders/meat traders/handlers and their families have been affected and facing lots of difficulties in meeting their financial needs due to closure of Ghazipur Slaughter House.*

8. *On 10th July 2022, there is Bakar Eid festival of Muslims and it is expected that 80,000-1,00,000 animals will be slaughtered in Delhi on this occasion. Some Muslims give qurbani of animals in their homes/premises whereas several Muslims prefer to sacrifice the animals Slaughter House on Eid festival. Due to closure of Ghazipur Slaughter House, Muslims will not be in position to slaughter their animals for qurbani on Bakar Eid. The blood, untreated liquid waste and solid waste will further add to the environmental and water pollution in that case.”*

Consideration of the Review Application and Orders

9. Scope of review does not extend to rehearing or reopening finality of an order but is limited to correcting a mistake/error causing miscarriage of justice. Reference may be made to *Surendra Koli v. State of U.P.*, (2014) 16 SCC 718, *Kamlesh Verma v. Mayawati* (2013) 8 SCC 320, *Northern India Caterers (India) Ltd. v. Lt. Governor of Delhi*, (1980) 2 SCC 167, and *Sow Chandra Kante v. Sk. Habib* (1975) 1 SCC 674.

10. Having regard to the proposal for legitimate source of water through the permitted borewells with proposed treatment by way of RO and other mechanism and also proposed recirculation of treated water except for direct contact meat, we partly modify the direction requiring adoption of ZLD system as condition for operation of the plant. While reiterating the

direction for 100% recirculation/reuse of treated water, which will be added as consent condition, treated waste water from ETP may be passed through nano filtration and RO as per the guidelines of CPCB. Such water after recovery should be of high quality for reuse. It may be further ensured that the unit suitably cuts down its water requirement, particularly for activities other than drinking and washing of meat. Letter of the DJB shows that permission has been granted for 180 MLD per bore which should be suitably reduced in view of the fact that the area is semi-critical in terms of availability of groundwater and increased consumption of water leads to generation of excessive waste water. Further, in case entire treated water is not utilized within the plant, there should be a proper destination for use of such treated water by the MCD for gardening etc., which should be part of consent terms. Only potable water may be used for washing of meat etc. and for drinking purposes.

11. In the light of above, joint Committee of CPCB and DPCC may hold a further meeting expeditiously to consider operation of the plant as per modified/laid down consent conditions and grant CTO for the plant. If any deficiency remains, compliance thereof be ensured in time bound manner. Groundwater extraction may be as per valid statutory permissions.

The review application will stand disposed of accordingly.

IA No. 154/2022 also stands disposed of.

A copy of this order be forwarded to CPCB and DPCC by e-mail for compliance.

M.A. No. 39/2022.

In view of order in the RA, no further order appears to be necessary on M.A. No. 39/2022 which will also stand disposed of.

Adarsh Kumar Goel, CP

Sudhir Agarwal, JM

Prof. A. Senthil Vel, EM

July 04, 2022
Review Application No. 17/2022
IN Original Application No. 214/2021
(I.A. No. 154/2022) with
M.A. No. 39/2022
DV